

SWE 637 Software Testing

Chapter 8.3

Applying Logic Coverage

In-class exercise

Dr. Brittany Johnson-Matthews

(Dr. B for short)

<https://go.gmu.edu/SWE637>

Adapted from slides by Jeff Offutt and Bob Kurtz

Exercise 8.3 #12

```
public final class GoodFastCheap {
    boolean good = false;
    boolean fast = false;
    boolean cheap = false;

    public void makeGood () {
        good = true;
        if (fast && cheap) cheap = false;
    }

    public void makeFast () {
        fast = true;
        if (good && cheap) good = false;
    }

    public void makeCheap () {
        cheap = true;
        if (good && fast) fast = false;
    }

    public void makeBad () { good = false };
    public void makeSlow () { fast = false };
    public void makeExpensive () { cheap = false; }

    public boolean isSatisfactory () {
        if ((good && fast) || (good && cheap) || (fast && cheap))
            return true;
        return false;
    }

    public boolean isSatisfactoryRefactored () {
        if (good && fast) return true;
        if (good && cheap) return true;
        if (fast && cheap) return true;
        return false;
    }
}
```

**Good, fast, and
cheap: pick any
two out of three!**

Analyze and test
this predicate

isSatisfactory Predicate

```
public boolean isSatisfactory () {  
    if ((good && fast) || (good && cheap) || (fast && cheap))  
        return true;  
    return false;  
}
```

Simplify the predicate:

$\mathcal{P} =$

isSatisfactory Predicate

```
public boolean isSatisfactory () {  
    if ((good && fast) || (good && cheap) || (fast && cheap))  
        return true;  
    return false;  
}
```

Simplify the predicate:

$$P = g \wedge f \vee g \wedge c \vee f \wedge c$$

RACC Tests for isSatisfactory

$$p = g \wedge f \vee g \wedge c \vee f \wedge c$$

| # | g | f | c | p | p _g | p _f | p _c |
|---|---|---|---|---|----------------|----------------|----------------|
| 1 | T | T | T | | | | |
| 2 | T | T | F | | | | |
| 3 | T | F | T | | | | |
| 4 | T | F | F | | | | |
| 5 | F | T | T | | | | |
| 6 | F | T | F | | | | |
| 7 | F | F | T | | | | |
| 8 | F | F | F | | | | |

Complete the truth table for p

RACC Tests for isSatisfactory

$$p = g \wedge f \vee g \wedge c \vee f \wedge c$$

| # | g | f | c | p | p_g | p_f | p_c |
|---|---|---|---|---|-------|-------|-------|
| 1 | T | T | T | T | | | |
| 2 | T | T | F | T | | | |
| 3 | T | F | T | T | | | |
| 4 | T | F | F | F | | | |
| 5 | F | T | T | T | | | |
| 6 | F | T | F | F | | | |
| 7 | F | F | T | F | | | |
| 8 | F | F | F | F | | | |

Complete the truth table for p

RACC Tests for isSatisfactory

$$p = g \wedge f \vee g \wedge c \vee f \wedge c$$

| # | g | f | c | p | p _g | p _f | p _c |
|---|---|---|---|---|----------------|----------------|----------------|
| 1 | T | T | T | T | | | |
| 2 | T | T | F | T | | | |
| 3 | T | F | T | T | | | |
| 4 | T | F | F | F | | | |
| 5 | F | T | T | T | | | |
| 6 | F | T | F | F | | | |
| 7 | F | F | T | F | | | |
| 8 | F | F | F | F | | | |

Determine conditions under which g determines p

$$P_g = P_{g=\text{true}} \oplus P_{g=\text{false}}$$

=

RACC Tests for isSatisfactory

$$p = g \wedge f \vee g \wedge c \vee f \wedge c$$

| # | g | f | c | p | p _g | p _f | p _c |
|---|---|---|---|---|----------------|----------------|----------------|
| 1 | T | T | T | T | | | |
| 2 | T | T | F | T | 1 | | |
| 3 | T | F | T | T | 2 | | |
| 4 | T | F | F | F | | | |
| 5 | F | T | T | T | | | |
| 6 | F | T | F | F | 1 | | |
| 7 | F | F | T | F | 2 | | |
| 8 | F | F | F | F | | | |

Determine conditions under which g determines p

$$\begin{aligned}
 P_g &= P_{g=\text{true}} \oplus P_{g=\text{false}} \\
 &= T \wedge f \vee T \wedge c \vee f \wedge c \oplus F \wedge f \vee F \wedge c \vee f \wedge c \\
 &= f \vee c \vee f \wedge c \oplus f \wedge c \\
 &= f \vee c \oplus f \wedge c \\
 &= f \wedge \neg c \vee \neg f \wedge c
 \end{aligned}$$

RACC Tests for isSatisfactory

$$p = g \wedge f \vee g \wedge c \vee f \wedge c$$

| # | g | f | c | p | p_g | p_f | p_c |
|---|---|---|---|---|-------|-------|-------|
| 1 | T | T | T | T | | | |
| 2 | T | T | F | T | 1 | | |
| 3 | T | F | T | T | 2 | | |
| 4 | T | F | F | F | | | |
| 5 | F | T | T | T | | | |
| 6 | F | T | F | F | 1 | | |
| 7 | F | F | T | F | 2 | | |
| 8 | F | F | F | F | | | |

Determine conditions under which f determines p

$$P_f = P_{f=\text{true}} \oplus P_{f=\text{false}}$$

=

RACC Tests for isSatisfactory

$$p = g \wedge f \vee g \wedge c \vee f \wedge c$$

| # | g | f | c | p | p _g | p _f | p _c |
|---|---|---|---|---|----------------|----------------|----------------|
| 1 | T | T | T | T | | | |
| 2 | T | T | F | T | 1 | 3 | |
| 3 | T | F | T | T | 2 | | |
| 4 | T | F | F | F | | 3 | |
| 5 | F | T | T | T | | 4 | |
| 6 | F | T | F | F | 1 | | |
| 7 | F | F | T | F | 2 | 4 | |
| 8 | F | F | F | F | | | |

Determine conditions under which f determines p

$$\begin{aligned}
 P_f &= P_{f=\text{true}} \oplus P_{f=\text{false}} \\
 &= g \wedge T \vee g \wedge c \vee T \wedge c \oplus g \wedge F \vee g \wedge c \vee F \wedge c \\
 &= g \vee g \wedge c \vee c \oplus g \wedge c \\
 &= g \vee c \oplus g \wedge c \\
 &= g \wedge \neg c \vee \neg g \wedge c
 \end{aligned}$$

RACC Tests for isSatisfactory

$$p = g \wedge f \vee g \wedge c \vee f \wedge c$$

| # | g | f | c | p | p _g | p _f | p _c |
|---|---|---|---|---|----------------|----------------|----------------|
| 1 | T | T | T | T | | | |
| 2 | T | T | F | T | 1 | 3 | |
| 3 | T | F | T | T | 2 | | |
| 4 | T | F | F | F | | 3 | |
| 5 | F | T | T | T | | 4 | |
| 6 | F | T | F | F | 1 | | |
| 7 | F | F | T | F | 2 | 4 | |
| 8 | F | F | F | F | | | |

Determine conditions under which c determines p

$$P_c = P_{c=true} \oplus P_{c=false}$$

$$=$$

RACC Tests for isSatisfactory

$$p = g \wedge f \vee g \wedge c \vee f \wedge c$$

| # | g | f | c | p | p _g | p _f | p _c |
|---|---|---|---|---|----------------|----------------|----------------|
| 1 | T | T | T | T | | | |
| 2 | T | T | F | T | 1 | 3 | |
| 3 | T | F | T | T | 2 | | 5 |
| 4 | T | F | F | F | | 3 | 5 |
| 5 | F | T | T | T | | 4 | 6 |
| 6 | F | T | F | F | 1 | | 6 |
| 7 | F | F | T | F | 2 | 4 | |
| 8 | F | F | F | F | | | |

Determine conditions under which c determines p

$$\begin{aligned}
 P_c &= P_{c=\text{true}} \oplus P_{c=\text{false}} \\
 &= g \wedge f \vee g \wedge T \vee f \wedge T \oplus g \wedge f \vee g \wedge F \vee f \wedge F \\
 &= g \wedge f \vee g \vee f \oplus g \wedge f \\
 &= g \vee f \oplus g \wedge f \\
 &= g \wedge \neg f \vee \neg g \wedge f
 \end{aligned}$$

RACC Tests for isSatisfactory

Develop a set of JUnit tests for method isSatisfactory() that satisfies the RACC criterion

DEFINITION

Restricted Active Clause Coverage (RACC) – For each p in P and each major clause c_i in C_p , choose minor clauses c_j ($j \neq i$) such that c_i determines p . TR has two requirements for c_j : c_j evaluates to true and c_j evaluates to false. The values chosen for minor clauses c_j must be the same when c_i is true as when c_i is false.

RACC Tests for isSatisfactory

Determine RACC tests for g , f , and c

| # | g | f | c | p | p_g | p_f | p_c |
|---|-----|-----|-----|-----|-------|-------|-------|
| 1 | T | T | T | T | | | |
| 2 | T | T | F | T | 1 | 3 | |
| 3 | T | F | T | T | 2 | | 5 |
| 4 | T | F | F | F | | 3 | 5 |
| 5 | F | T | T | T | | 4 | 6 |
| 6 | F | T | F | F | 1 | | 6 |
| 7 | F | F | T | F | 2 | 4 | |
| 8 | F | F | F | F | | | |

For g : (2,6) or (3,7)

RACC Tests for isSatisfactory

| # | g | f | c | p | p _g | p _f | p _c |
|---|---|---|---|---|----------------|----------------|----------------|
| 1 | T | T | T | T | | | |
| 2 | T | T | F | T | 1 | 3 | |
| 3 | T | F | T | T | 2 | | 5 |
| 4 | T | F | F | F | | 3 | 5 |
| 5 | F | T | T | T | | 4 | 6 |
| 6 | F | T | F | F | 1 | | 6 |
| 7 | F | F | T | F | 2 | 4 | |
| 8 | F | F | F | F | | | |

Determine RACC tests for g , f , and c

For g : (2,6) or (3,7)

For f :

RACC Tests for isSatisfactory

| # | g | f | c | p | p _g | p _f | p _c |
|---|---|---|---|---|----------------|----------------|----------------|
| 1 | T | T | T | T | | | |
| 2 | T | T | F | T | 1 | 3 | |
| 3 | T | F | T | T | 2 | | 5 |
| 4 | T | F | F | F | | 3 | 5 |
| 5 | F | T | T | T | | 4 | 6 |
| 6 | F | T | F | F | 1 | | 6 |
| 7 | F | F | T | F | 2 | 4 | |
| 8 | F | F | F | F | | | |

Determine RACC tests for g , f , and c

For g : (2,6) or (3,7)

For f : (2,4) or (5,7)

For c :

RACC Tests for isSatisfactory

| # | g | f | c | p | p _g | p _f | p _c |
|---|---|---|---|---|----------------|----------------|----------------|
| 1 | T | T | T | T | | | |
| 2 | T | T | F | T | 1 | 3 | |
| 3 | T | F | T | T | 2 | | 5 |
| 4 | T | F | F | F | | 3 | 5 |
| 5 | F | T | T | T | | 4 | 6 |
| 6 | F | T | F | F | 1 | | 6 |
| 7 | F | F | T | F | 2 | 4 | |
| 8 | F | F | F | F | | | |

There are various minimal combinations of tests, but we'll arbitrarily choose
{ 2, 3, 4, 6 }

Determine RACC tests for **g**, **f**, and **c**

For **g**: (2,6) or (3,7)

For **f**: (2,4) or (5,7)

For **c**: (3,4) or (5,6)

Minimal combinations:

{2,3,4,6}, {2,4,5,6}, {2,5,6,7},
{2,3,4,7}, {3,4,5,7}, {3,5,6,7}

RACC Tests for isSatisfactory

| # | g | f | c | p | p _g | p _f | p _c |
|---|---|---|---|---|----------------|----------------|----------------|
| 1 | T | T | T | T | | | |
| 2 | T | T | F | T | 1 | 3 | |
| 3 | T | F | T | T | 2 | | 5 |
| 4 | T | F | F | F | | 3 | 5 |
| 5 | F | T | T | T | | 4 | 6 |
| 6 | F | T | F | F | 1 | | 6 |
| 7 | F | F | T | F | 2 | 4 | |
| 8 | F | F | F | F | | | |

RACC tests: 2,3,4,6
{ TTF, TFT, TFF, FTF }

```
GoodFastCheap gfc;

@Before public void setUp() {
    gfc = new GoodFastCheap(); //8: FFF
}

@Test public void test2() throws Exception {
    gfc.makeGood(); //4: TFF
    gfc.makeFast(); //2: TTF
    assertTrue(gfc.isSatisfactory());
}

@Test public void test3() throws Exception {
    gfc.makeGood(); //4: TFF
    gfc.makeCheap(); //3: TFT
    assertTrue(gfc.isSatisfactory());
}

@Test public void test4() throws Exception {
    gfc.makeGood(); //4: TFF
    assertFalse(gfc.isSatisfactory());
}

@Test public void test6() throws Exception {
    gfc.makeFast(); //6: FTF
    assertFalse(gfc.isSatisfactory());
}
```

END OF EXERCISE

Exercise 8.3 #12

```
public final class GoodFastCheap {
    boolean good = false;
    boolean fast = false;
    boolean cheap = false;

    public void makeGood () {
        good = true;
        if (fast && cheap) cheap = false;
    }

    public void makeFast () {
        fast = true;
        if (good && cheap) good = false;
    }

    public void makeCheap () {
        cheap = true;
        if (good && fast) fast = false;
    }

    public void makeBad () { good = false };
    public void makeSlow () { fast = false };
    public void makeExpensive () { cheap = false; }

    public boolean isSatisfactory () {
        if ((good && fast) || (good && cheap) || (fast && cheap))
            return true;
        return false;
    }

    public boolean isSatisfactoryRefactored () {
        if (good && fast) return true;
        if (good && cheap) return true;
        if (fast && cheap) return true;
        return false;
    }
}
```

Analyze and test
this predicate

**Good, fast, and
cheap: pick any
two out of three!**

IsSatisfactoryRefactored Predicate

```
public boolean isSatisfactory () {  
    if ((good && fast) || (good && cheap) || (fast && cheap))  
        return true;  
    return false;  
}
```

Simplify the predicates:

$P_1 =$

$P_2 =$

$P_3 =$

IsSatisfactoryRefactored Predicate

```
public boolean isSatisfactory () {  
    if ((good && fast) || (good && cheap) || (fast && cheap))  
        return true;  
    return false;  
}
```

Simplify the predicates:

$$P_1 = g \wedge f$$

$$P_2 = g \wedge c$$

$$P_3 = f \wedge c$$

RACC for IsSatisfactoryRefactored

Compute p and determine when g and f determine p_1

| $p_1 =$ | | | | | | $p_2 =$ | | | | | | $p_3 =$ | | | | | |
|---------|---|---|---|-------|-------|---------|---|---|---|-------|-------|---------|---|---|---|-------|-------|
| # | g | f | P | p_g | p_f | # | g | c | p | p_g | p_c | # | f | c | p | p_f | p_c |
| 1 | T | T | T | ✓ | ✓ | 5 | T | T | | | | 9 | T | T | | | |
| 2 | T | F | F | | ✓ | 6 | T | F | | | | 10 | T | F | | | |
| 3 | F | T | F | ✓ | | 7 | F | T | | | | 11 | F | T | | | |
| 4 | F | F | F | | | 8 | F | F | | | | 12 | F | F | | | |

RACC for IsSatisfactoryRefactored

Compute RACC test
pairs for g and f

TRs for g :

TRs for f :

| $p_1 =$ | | | | | | $p_2 =$ | | | | | | $p_3 =$ | | | | | |
|---------|-----|-----|-----|-------|-------|---------|-----|-----|-----|-------|-------|---------|-----|-----|-----|-------|-------|
| # | g | f | P | p_g | p_f | # | g | c | p | p_g | p_c | # | f | c | p | p_f | p_c |
| 1 | T | T | T | ✓ | ✓ | 5 | T | T | | | | 9 | T | T | | | |
| 2 | T | F | F | | ✓ | 6 | T | F | | | | 10 | T | F | | | |
| 3 | F | T | F | ✓ | | 7 | F | T | | | | 11 | F | T | | | |
| 4 | F | F | F | | | 8 | F | F | | | | 12 | F | F | | | |

RACC for IsSatisfactoryRefactored

Compute RACC test pairs for g and f

TRs for g : (1,3)

TRs for f : (1,2)

| $p_1 =$ | | | | | | $p_2 =$ | | | | | | $p_3 =$ | | | | | |
|---------|-----|-----|-----|-------|-------|---------|-----|-----|-----|-------|-------|---------|-----|-----|-----|-------|-------|
| # | g | f | P | p_g | p_f | # | g | c | p | p_g | p_c | # | f | c | p | p_f | p_c |
| 1 | T | T | T | ✓ | ✓ | 5 | T | T | | | | 9 | T | T | | | |
| 2 | T | F | F | | ✓ | 6 | T | F | | | | 10 | T | F | | | |
| 3 | F | T | F | ✓ | | 7 | F | T | | | | 11 | F | T | | | |
| 4 | F | F | F | | | 8 | F | F | | | | 12 | F | F | | | |

RACC for IsSatisfactoryRefactored

Compute p and determine when g and c determine p_2

TRs for g : (1,3)

TRs for f : (1,2)

| $p_1 =$ | | | | | | $p_2 =$ | | | | | | $p_3 =$ | | | | | |
|---------|---|---|---|-------|-------|---------|---|---|---|-------|-------|---------|---|---|---|-------|-------|
| # | g | f | P | p_g | p_f | # | g | c | p | p_g | p_c | # | f | c | p | p_f | p_c |
| 1 | T | T | T | ✓ | ✓ | 5 | T | T | T | ✓ | ✓ | 9 | T | T | | | |
| 2 | T | F | F | | ✓ | 6 | T | F | F | | ✓ | 10 | T | F | | | |
| 3 | F | T | F | ✓ | | 7 | F | T | F | ✓ | | 11 | F | T | | | |
| 4 | F | F | F | | | 8 | F | F | F | | | 12 | F | F | | | |

RACC for IsSatisfactoryRefactored

Compute p and determine when g and c determine p_2

TRs for g : (1,3)

TRs for f : (1,2)

Compute RACC test
pairs for g and c

TRs for g :

TRs for c :

| $p_1 =$ | | | | | |
|---------|-----|-----|-----|-------|-------|
| # | g | f | P | p_g | p_f |
| 1 | T | T | T | ✓ | ✓ |
| 2 | T | F | F | | ✓ |
| 3 | F | T | F | ✓ | |
| 4 | F | F | F | | |

| # | g | | p | p_g | p_c |
|---|-----|--|-----|-------|-------|
| 5 | T | | T | ✓ | ✓ |
| 6 | T | | F | | ✓ |
| 7 | F | | F | ✓ | |
| 8 | F | | F | | |

| $p_3 =$ | | | | | |
|---------|-----|-----|-----|-------|-------|
| # | f | c | p | p_f | p_c |
| 9 | T | T | | | |
| 10 | T | F | | | |
| 11 | F | T | | | |
| 12 | F | F | | | |

RACC for IsSatisfactoryRefactored

Compute p and determine when g and c determine p_2

TRs for g : (1,3)

TRs for f : (1,2)

Compute RACC test
pairs for g and c

TRs for g : (5,7)

TRs for c : (5,6)

| $p_1 =$ | | | | | |
|---------|-----|-----|-----|-------|-------|
| # | g | f | P | p_g | p_f |
| 1 | T | T | T | ✓ | ✓ |
| 2 | T | F | F | | ✓ |
| 3 | F | T | F | ✓ | |
| 4 | F | F | F | | |

| # | g | | p | p_g | p_c |
|---|-----|--|-----|-------|-------|
| 5 | T | | T | ✓ | ✓ |
| 6 | T | | F | | ✓ |
| 7 | F | | F | ✓ | |
| 8 | F | | F | | |

| $p_3 =$ | | | | | |
|---------|-----|-----|-----|-------|-------|
| # | f | c | p | p_f | p_c |
| 9 | T | T | | | |
| 10 | T | F | | | |
| 11 | F | T | | | |
| 12 | F | F | | | |

RACC for IsSatisfactoryRefactored

Compute p and determine when g and f determine p_3

TRs for g : (1,3)

TRs for f : (1,2)

TRs for g : (5,7)

TRs for c : (5,6)

| $p_1 =$ | | | | | |
|---------|-----|-----|-----|-------|-------|
| # | g | f | P | p_g | p_f |
| 1 | T | T | T | ✓ | ✓ |
| 2 | T | F | F | | ✓ |
| 3 | F | T | F | ✓ | |
| 4 | F | F | F | | |

| # | g | | p | p_g | p_c |
|---|-----|--|-----|-------|-------|
| 5 | T | | T | ✓ | ✓ |
| 6 | T | | F | | ✓ |
| 7 | F | | F | ✓ | |
| 8 | F | | F | | |

| $p_3 =$ | | | | | |
|---------|-----|-----|-----|-------|-------|
| # | f | c | p | p_f | p_c |
| 9 | T | T | T | ✓ | ✓ |
| 10 | T | F | F | | ✓ |
| 11 | F | T | F | ✓ | |
| 12 | F | F | F | | |

RACC for IsSatisfactoryRefactored

Compute p and determine when g and f determine p_3

TRs for g : (1,3)

TRs for f : (1,2)

TRs for g : (5,7)

TRs for c : (5,6)

Compute RACC test pairs for f and c

TRs for f :

TRs for c :

| $p_1 =$ | | | | | |
|---------|-----|-----|-----|-------|-------|
| # | g | f | P | p_g | p_f |
| 1 | T | T | T | ✓ | ✓ |
| 2 | T | F | F | | ✓ |
| 3 | F | T | F | ✓ | |
| 4 | F | F | F | | |

| # | g | | p | p_g | p_c |
|---|-----|--|-----|-------|-------|
| 5 | T | | T | ✓ | ✓ |
| 6 | T | | F | | ✓ |
| 7 | F | | F | ✓ | |
| 8 | F | | F | | |

| $p_3 =$ | | | | | |
|---------|-----|-----|-----|-------|-------|
| # | f | c | p | p_f | p_c |
| 9 | T | T | T | ✓ | ✓ |
| 10 | T | F | F | | ✓ |
| 11 | F | T | F | ✓ | |
| 12 | F | F | F | | |

RACC for IsSatisfactoryRefactored

Compute p and determine when g and f determine p_3

TRs for g : (1,3)

TRs for f : (1,2)

TRs for g : (5,7)

TRs for c : (5,6)

Compute RACC test pairs for f and c

TRs for f : (9,11)

TRs for c : (9,10)

| $p_1 =$ | | | | | |
|---------|-----|-----|-----|-------|-------|
| # | g | f | P | p_g | p_f |
| 1 | T | T | T | ✓ | ✓ |
| 2 | T | F | F | | ✓ |
| 3 | F | T | F | ✓ | |
| 4 | F | F | F | | |

| # | g | | p | p_g | p_c |
|---|-----|--|-----|-------|-------|
| 5 | T | | T | ✓ | ✓ |
| 6 | T | | F | | ✓ |
| 7 | F | | F | ✓ | |
| 8 | F | | F | | |

| $p_3 =$ | | | | | |
|---------|-----|-----|-----|-------|-------|
| # | f | c | p | p_f | p_c |
| 9 | T | T | T | ✓ | ✓ |
| 10 | T | F | F | | ✓ |
| 11 | F | T | F | ✓ | |
| 12 | F | F | F | | |

RACC for IsSatisfactoryRefactored

Note that to reach $g \wedge c$, $g \wedge f$ must be false. To reach $f \wedge c$, $g \wedge c$ and $g \wedge f$ must be false. That suggests we should work from the bottom up!

For $f \wedge c$:

TRs for g : (1,3) and (5,7)

TRs for f : (1,2) and (9,11)

TRs for c : (5,6) and (9,10)

| $p_1 =$ | | | | | |
|---------|---|---|---|-------|-------|
| # | g | f | P | p_g | p_f |
| 1 | T | T | T | ✓ | ✓ |
| 2 | T | F | F | | ✓ |
| 3 | F | T | F | ✓ | |
| 4 | F | F | F | | |

| $p_2 =$ | | | | | |
|---------|---|--|---|-------|-------|
| # | g | | p | p_g | p_c |
| 5 | T | | T | ✓ | ✓ |
| 6 | T | | F | | ✓ |
| 7 | F | | F | ✓ | |
| 8 | F | | F | | |

| $p_3 =$ | | | | | |
|---------|---|---|---|-------|-------|
| # | f | c | p | p_f | p_c |
| 9 | T | T | T | ✓ | ✓ |
| 10 | T | F | F | | ✓ |
| 11 | F | T | F | ✓ | |
| 12 | F | F | F | | |

RACC for IsSatisfactoryRefactored

Note that to reach $g \wedge c$, $g \wedge f$ must be false. To reach $f \wedge c$, $g \wedge c$ and $g \wedge f$ must be false. That suggests we should work from the bottom up!

TRs for g : (1,3) and (5,7)
 TRs for f : (1,2) and (9,11)
 TRs for c : (5,6) and (9,10)

For $f \wedge c$: tests 9, 10, 11
 { *TT, *TF, *FT }

Which solutions are controllable and reachable?

| $p_1 =$ | | | | | |
|---------|---|---|---|-------|-------|
| # | g | f | P | p_g | p_f |
| 1 | T | T | T | ✓ | ✓ |
| 2 | T | F | F | | ✓ |
| 3 | F | T | F | ✓ | |
| 4 | F | F | F | | |

| # | g | | p | p_g | p_c |
|---|---|--|---|-------|-------|
| 5 | T | | T | ✓ | ✓ |
| 6 | T | | F | | ✓ |
| 7 | F | | F | ✓ | |
| 8 | F | | F | | |

| $p_3 =$ | | | | | |
|---------|---|---|---|-------|-------|
| # | f | c | p | p_f | p_c |
| 9 | T | T | T | ✓ | ✓ |
| 10 | T | F | F | | ✓ |
| 11 | F | T | F | ✓ | |
| 12 | F | F | F | | |

RACC for IsSatisfactoryRefactored

TRs for g : (1,3) and (5,7)

TRs for f : (1,2) and (9,11)

TRs for c : (5,6) and (9,10)

For $f \wedge c$: tests 9, 10, 11

{ *TT, *TF, *FT }

Which solutions are controllable and reachable?

{ FTT, FTF, FFT }

All others won't reach

Note that to reach $g \wedge c$, $g \wedge f$ must be false. To reach $f \wedge c$, $g \wedge c$ and $g \wedge f$ must be false. That suggests we should work from the bottom up!

| $p_1 =$ | | | | | |
|---------|---|---|---|-------|-------|
| # | g | f | P | p_g | p_f |
| 1 | T | T | T | ✓ | ✓ |
| 2 | T | F | F | | ✓ |
| 3 | F | T | F | ✓ | |
| 4 | F | F | F | | |

| # | g | | p | p_g | p_c |
|---|---|--|---|-------|-------|
| 5 | T | | T | ✓ | ✓ |
| 6 | T | | F | | ✓ |
| 7 | F | | F | ✓ | |
| 8 | F | | F | | |

| $p_3 =$ | | | | | |
|---------|---|---|---|-------|-------|
| # | f | c | p | p_f | p_c |
| 9 | T | T | T | ✓ | ✓ |
| 10 | T | F | F | | ✓ |
| 11 | F | T | F | ✓ | |
| 12 | F | F | F | | |

RACC for IsSatisfactoryRefactored

TRs for g : (1,3) and (5,7)

TRs for f : (1,2) and (9,11)

TRs for c : (5,6) and (9,10)

$f \wedge c$: { FTT, FTF, FFT }

For $g \wedge c$:

| $p_1 =$ | | | | | |
|---------|-----|-----|-----|-------|-------|
| # | g | f | P | p_g | p_f |
| 1 | T | T | T | ✓ | ✓ |
| 2 | T | F | F | | ✓ |
| 3 | F | T | F | ✓ | |
| 4 | F | F | F | | |

| # | g | | p | p_g | p_c |
|---|-----|--|-----|-------|-------|
| 5 | T | | T | ✓ | ✓ |
| 6 | T | | F | | ✓ |
| 7 | F | | F | ✓ | |
| 8 | F | | F | | |

| $p_3 =$ | | | | | |
|---------|-----|-----|-----|-------|-------|
| # | f | c | p | p_f | p_c |
| 9 | T | T | T | ✓ | ✓ |
| 10 | T | F | F | | ✓ |
| 11 | F | T | F | ✓ | |
| 12 | F | F | F | | |

RACC for IsSatisfactoryRefactored

TRs for g : (1,3) and (5,7)

TRs for f : (1,2) and (9,11)

TRs for c : (5,6) and (9,10)

$f \wedge c$: { FTT, FTF, FFT }

For $g \wedge c$: tests 5, 6, 7

{ T*T, T*F, F*T }

Which solutions are controllable and reachable?

| $p_1 =$ | | | | | | $p_2 =$ | | | | | | $p_3 =$ | | | | | |
|---------|-----|-----|-----|-------|-------|---------|-----|--|-----|-------|-------|---------|-----|-----|-----|-------|-------|
| # | g | f | P | p_g | p_f | # | g | | p | p_g | p_c | # | f | c | p | p_f | p_c |
| 1 | T | T | T | ✓ | ✓ | 5 | T | | T | ✓ | ✓ | 9 | T | T | T | ✓ | ✓ |
| 2 | T | F | F | | ✓ | 6 | T | | F | | ✓ | 10 | T | F | F | | ✓ |
| 3 | F | T | F | ✓ | | 7 | F | | F | ✓ | | 11 | F | T | F | ✓ | |
| 4 | F | F | F | | | 8 | F | | F | | | 12 | F | F | F | | |

RACC for IsSatisfactoryRefactored

TRs for g : (1,3) and (5,7)

TRs for f : (1,2) and (9,11)

TRs for c : (5,6) and (9,10)

$f \wedge c$: { FTT, FTF, FFT }

For $g \wedge c$: tests 5, 6, 7

{ T*T, T*F, F*T }

Which solutions are controllable and reachable?

{ TFT, TFF, F*T }

All others won't reach $f \wedge c$

| $p_1 =$ | | | | | | $p_2 =$ | | | | | | $p_3 =$ | | | | | |
|---------|-----|-----|-----|-------|-------|---------|-----|--|-----|-------|-------|---------|-----|-----|-----|-------|-------|
| # | g | f | P | p_g | p_f | # | g | | p | p_g | p_c | # | f | c | p | p_f | p_c |
| 1 | T | T | T | ✓ | ✓ | 5 | T | | T | ✓ | ✓ | 9 | T | T | T | ✓ | ✓ |
| 2 | T | F | F | | ✓ | 6 | T | | F | | ✓ | 10 | T | F | F | | ✓ |
| 3 | F | T | F | ✓ | | 7 | F | | F | ✓ | | 11 | F | T | F | ✓ | |
| 4 | F | F | F | | | 8 | F | | F | | | 12 | F | F | F | | |

RACC for IsSatisfactoryRefactored

TRs for g : (1,3) and (5,7)

TRs for f : (1,2) and (9,11)

TRs for c : (5,6) and (9,10)

$f \wedge c$: { FTT, FTF, FFT }

$g \wedge c$: { TFT, TFF, F*T }

For $g \wedge f$:

| $p_1 =$ | | | | | |
|---------|-----|-----|-----|-------|-------|
| # | g | f | P | p_g | p_f |
| 1 | T | T | T | ✓ | ✓ |
| 2 | T | F | F | | ✓ |
| 3 | F | T | F | ✓ | |
| 4 | F | F | F | | |

| # | g | | p | p_g | p_c |
|---|-----|--|-----|-------|-------|
| 5 | T | | T | ✓ | ✓ |
| 6 | T | | F | | ✓ |
| 7 | F | | F | ✓ | |
| 8 | F | | F | | |

| $p_3 =$ | | | | | |
|---------|-----|-----|-----|-------|-------|
| # | f | c | p | p_f | p_c |
| 9 | T | T | T | ✓ | ✓ |
| 10 | T | F | F | | ✓ |
| 11 | F | T | F | ✓ | |
| 12 | F | F | F | | |

RACC for IsSatisfactoryRefactored

TRs for g : (1,3) and (5,7)

TRs for f : (1,2) and (9,11)

TRs for c : (5,6) and (9,10)

$f \wedge c$: { FTT, FTF, FFT }

$g \wedge c$: { TFT, TFF, F*T }

For $g \wedge f$: tests 1, 2, 3

{ TT*, TF*, FT* }

Which solutions are controllable and reachable?

| $p_1 =$ | | | | | | $p_2 =$ | | | | | | $p_3 =$ | | | | | |
|---------|---|---|---|-------|-------|---------|---|--|---|-------|-------|---------|---|---|---|-------|-------|
| # | g | f | P | p_g | p_f | # | g | | p | p_g | p_c | # | f | c | p | p_f | p_c |
| 1 | T | T | T | ✓ | ✓ | 5 | T | | T | ✓ | ✓ | 9 | T | T | T | ✓ | ✓ |
| 2 | T | F | F | | ✓ | 6 | T | | F | | ✓ | 10 | T | F | F | | ✓ |
| 3 | F | T | F | ✓ | | 7 | F | | F | ✓ | | 11 | F | T | F | ✓ | |
| 4 | F | F | F | | | 8 | F | | F | | | 12 | F | F | F | | |

RACC for IsSatisfactoryRefactored

TRs for g : (1,3) and (5,7)

TRs for f : (1,2) and (9,11)

TRs for c : (5,6) and (9,10)

$f\wedge c$: { FTT, FTF, FFT }

$g\wedge c$: { TFT, TFF, F*T }

For $g\wedge f$: tests 1, 2, 3

{ TT*, TF*, FT* }

Which solutions are controllable and reachable?

{ TTF, TF*, FT* }

| $p_1 =$ | | | | | | $p_3 =$ | | | | | | | | | | | |
|---------|-----|-----|-----|-------|-------|---------|-----|-----|-----|-------|-------|----|-----|-----|-----|-------|-------|
| # | g | f | P | p_g | p_f | # | g | c | p | p_g | p_c | # | f | c | p | p_f | p_c |
| 1 | T | T | T | ✓ | ✓ | 5 | T | | T | ✓ | ✓ | 9 | T | T | T | ✓ | ✓ |
| 2 | T | F | F | | ✓ | 6 | T | | F | | ✓ | 10 | T | F | F | | ✓ |
| 3 | F | T | F | ✓ | | 7 | F | | F | ✓ | | 11 | F | T | F | ✓ | |
| 4 | F | F | F | | | 8 | F | | F | | | 12 | F | F | F | | |

RACC for IsSatisfactoryRefactored

TRs for g : (1,3) and (5,7)

TRs for f : (1,2) and (9,11)

TRs for c : (5,6) and (9,10)

$f \wedge c$: { FTT, FTF, FFT }

$g \wedge c$: { TFT, TFF, F*T }

$g \wedge f$: { TTF, TF*, FT* }

Fill in the *s for a minimal set of test inputs:

| $p_1 =$ | | | | | | $p_2 =$ | | | | | | $p_3 =$ | | | | | |
|---------|-----|-----|-----|-------|-------|---------|-----|--|-----|-------|-------|---------|-----|-----|-----|-------|-------|
| # | g | f | P | p_g | p_f | # | g | | p | p_g | p_c | # | f | c | p | p_f | p_c |
| 1 | T | T | T | ✓ | ✓ | 5 | T | | T | ✓ | ✓ | 9 | T | T | T | ✓ | ✓ |
| 2 | T | F | F | | ✓ | 6 | T | | F | | ✓ | 10 | T | F | F | | ✓ |
| 3 | F | T | F | ✓ | | 7 | F | | F | ✓ | | 11 | F | T | F | ✓ | |
| 4 | F | F | F | | | 8 | F | | F | | | 12 | F | F | F | | |

RACC for IsSatisfactoryRefactored

TRs for g : (1,3) and (5,7)

TRs for f : (1,2) and (9,11)

TRs for c : (5,6) and (9,10)

$f \wedge c$: { FTT, FTF, FFT }

$g \wedge c$: { TFT, TFF, F*T }

$g \wedge f$: { TTF, TF*, FT* }

Fill in the *s for a minimal set of test inputs:

{ FTT, FTF, FFT, TFT, TFF, TTF }

Compare to isSatisfactory:

{ TTF, TFT, TFF, FTF }

| $p_1 =$ | | | | | |
|---------|-----|-----|-----|-------|-------|
| # | g | f | P | p_g | p_f |
| 1 | T | T | T | ✓ | ✓ |
| 2 | T | F | F | | ✓ |
| 3 | F | T | F | ✓ | |
| 4 | F | F | F | | |

| # | g | | p | p_g | p_c |
|---|-----|--|-----|-------|-------|
| 5 | T | | T | ✓ | ✓ |
| 6 | T | | F | | ✓ |
| 7 | F | | F | ✓ | |
| 8 | F | | F | | |

| $p_3 =$ | | | | | |
|---------|-----|-----|-----|-------|-------|
| # | f | c | p | p_f | p_c |
| 9 | T | T | T | ✓ | ✓ |
| 10 | T | F | F | | ✓ |
| 11 | F | T | F | ✓ | |
| 12 | F | F | F | | |

RACC Tests for IsSatisfactory

```
GoodFastCheap gfc;

@Before public void setUp() {
    gfc = new GoodFastCheap();    // 8:  F F F
}

@Test public void test1() throws Exception {
    gfc.makeGood();               // 4:  T F F
    gfc.makeFast();               // 2:  T T F
    assertTrue(gfc.isSatisfactory());
}

@Test public void test2() throws Exception {
    gfc.makeGood();               // 4:  T F F
    assertFalse(gfc.isSatisfactory());
}

@Test public void test3() throws Exception {
    gfc.makeFast();               // 6:  F T F
    assertFalse(gfc.isSatisfactory());
}

@Test public void test4() throws Exception {
    gfc.makeGood();               // 4:  T F F
    gfc.makeCheap();              // 3:  T F T
    assertTrue(gfc.isSatisfactory());
}
```

```
@Test public void test5() throws Exception
{
    gfc.makeCheap();              // 7:  F F T
    assertFalse(gfc.isSatisfactory());
}

@Test public void test6() throws Exception
{
    gfc.makeFast();               // 6:  F T F
    gfc.makeCheap();              // 5:  F T T
    assertTrue(gfc.isSatisfactory());
}
```